



Coordinating Policy Instruments that influence Soil, Water and Biodiversity in Scotland

ESCom Seminar Series
23rd May 2017

**Kirsty Blackstock, Paula Novo, Kerry Waylen,
Alba Juarez Bourke, Anja Byg, Jessica
Maxwell**



Purpose of the Workshop

- To take stock of research to date
 - 1.3.4 (Biodiversity) & 1.4.2 (Natural Assets)
- Check that our original rationale holds
- Share draft findings before more analysis

- Invited stakeholders with interest and expertise

- Chatham House Rules
 - Frank discussions that will not be attributed to any individual
- Note taking and photographs



1.3.4: Why research the governance of biodiversity management?

- National & international policy agendas give rise to these questions:
 - What are the different governance mechanisms that can be used to meet biodiversity and prosperity goals?
 - How do they operate & are perceived by stakeholders?
- Synthesis and assessment of current biodiversity management measures
 - Overview of different policy instruments
 - Handling of trade-offs
 - Factors influencing uptake and implementation
 - Using desk based review + interviews



1.4.2: Why research integration of policy instruments?

- National and international policy agendas give rise to these questions:
 - Do these policy instruments take into account each other, and the delivery of multiple benefits?
 - Is there need for policy integration? (Policy 3 of LUS)? Could we adjust current policy instruments, to balance multiple goals?
- Synthesis and assessment of current Scottish policy instruments influencing soil, water and biodiversity
 - Overview of state of the environment
 - Long list of instruments and analysis of sub-sample (10)
 - Degree of interaction/coordination/cross referencing
 - Desk based review and interviews



Similarities and Differences

- **Policy Drivers:** 1.4.2 broader than 1.3.4 but many are shared
- **Focus:** instruments not parent policies or legislation
- **Topic:** 1.4.2 is about biodiversity as well as soil and water, 1.3.4 focused on biodiversity alone
- **Geographical Focus:** 1.4.2 only Scottish to date, 1.3.4 is international
- **Definition of policy instrument:** 1.4.2 only government funded; 1.3.4 all instruments
- **Methods:** difference in sampling approach but similar combination of review and interviews





Living Graph (1)

- Think of your personal response to the following question:
- **To what degree are you satisfied with the way that current Scottish Biodiversity policy instruments are working?**
- Taking the wall as the axis, arrange yourself along the wall to reflect your position on the scale – **very satisfied to very unsatisfied**
- Talk to each other to develop your relative positions
- If you don't know or don't want to answer, form an 'island'
- Be ready to briefly explain your answer





Living Graph (2)

- Think of your personal response to the following question:
- **To what degree do you believe that we need more integration of biodiversity, soils and water policies?**
- Taking the wall as the axis, arrange yourself along the wall to reflect your position on the scale – **lots more integration to no more integration**
- Talk to each other to develop your relative positions
- If you don't know or don't want to answer, form an 'island'
- Be ready to briefly explain your answer



Break Out Discussions



The James
Hutton
Institute

| Biodiversity | Integration |
|-------------------|---------------------|
| Paula Novo | Kerry Waylen |
| Joanna Drewitt | Sandra Marks |
| Louise Bond | Helen Jones |
| Bruce Wilson | Nicola Melville |
| Clive Mitchell | Rebecca Audsley |
| Jan Dick | Sarah Govan |
| Hannah Eamer | Andy Tharme |





The James
Hutton
Institute

Break out feedback

- How can we improve delivery?
- What are the challenges of doing this?
- Any solutions?





The James
Hutton
Institute

Discussion on Research

- Do these ideas resonate with your experiences?
- What, if anything, is missing from our analysis?
- Have we diagnosed the problems correctly?
- Does Brexit give us new opportunities?





The James
Hutton
Institute

Next Steps

- Evaluation Form
- Workshop report and blog on ESCom website
- 1.3.4: interviews and report
- 1.4.2: interviews and paper (plus briefing if requested)
- Lunch





The James
Hutton
Institute

Points of clarification or additional detail?

Thanks to the RESAS Strategic Research Programme 2016-21

Kerry.Waylen@Hutton.ac.uk

Paula.Novo@Hutton.ac.uk

Kirsty.Blackstock@Hutton.ac.uk



Scottish Government
Riaghaltas na h-Alba
gov.scot